

UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS
FOR THE THIRD CIRCUIT

Nos. 23-1664, 23-1665, 23-1666, 23-1667, 23-1668, 23-1669, 23-1670, 23-1671,
23-1672, 23-1673, 23-1674, 23-1675, 23-1676, 23-1677, 23-1678 & 23-1780

In re: BOY SCOUTS OF AMERICA; and DELAWARE BSA LLC;
Debtors

LUJAN CLAIMANTS,
Appellants in No. 23-1664

LIBERTY MUTUAL INSURANCE COMPANY; THE OHIO CASUALTY
INSURANCE COMPANY; LIBERTY INSURANCE UNDERWRITERS, INC.;
LIBERTY SURPLUS INSURANCE CORPORATION,
Appellants in No. 23-1665

DUMAS & VAUGHN CLAIMANTS,
Appellants in No. 23-1666

THE CONTINENTAL INSURANCE COMPANY; COLUMBIA CASUALTY
COMPANY,
Appellants in No. 23-1667

NATIONAL UNION FIRE INSURANCE CO OF PITTSBURGH PENNSYLVANIA;
LEXINGTON INSURANCE COMPANY; LANDMARK INSURANCE COMPANY;
THE INSURANCE COMPANY OF THE STATE OF PENNSYLVANIA,
Appellants in No. 23-1668

INDIAN HARBOR INSURANCE COMPANY,
Appellant in No. 23-1669

OLD REPUBLIC INSURANCE COMPANY,
Appellant in No. 23-1670

TRAVELERS CASUALTY AND SURETY COMPANY, INC.; ST. PAUL SURPLUS
LINES INSURANCE COMPAN; GULF INSURANCE COMPANY,
Appellants in No. 23-1671

GREAT AMERICAN ASSURANCE COMPANY; GREAT AMERICAN E&S
INSURANCE COMPANY,
Appellants in No. 23-1672

ALLIANZ GLOBAL RISKS US INSURANCE COMPANY; NATIONAL SURETY
CORPORATION; INTERSTATE FIRE & CASUALTY COMPANY,
Appellants in No. 23-1673

ARGONAUT INSURANCE COMPANY; COLONY INSURANCE COMPANY,
Appellants in No. 23-1674

GEMINI INSURANCE COMPANY,
Appellant in No. 23-1675

GENERAL STAR INDEMNITY COMPANY,
Appellant in No. 23-1676

ARROWOOD INDEMNITY COMPANY,
Appellant in No. 23-1677

TRADERS AND PACIFIC INSURANCE COMPANY; ENDURANCE AMERICAN
SPECIALTY INSURANCE COMPANY; ENDURANCE AMERICA INSURANCE
COMPANY,
Appellants in No. 23-1678

ARCH INSURANCE COMPANY,
Appellant in No. 23-1780

On Appeal from the United States District Court
for the District of Delaware
(D.C. Nos. 1:22-cv-01237, 1:22-cv-01238, 1:22-cv-01239, 1:22-cv-01240, 1:22-cv-
01241, 1:22-cv-01243, 1:22-cv-01244, 1:22-cv-01245, 1:22-cv-01246, 1:22-cv-01247,
1:22-cv-01249, 1:22-cv-01250, 1:22-cv-01251, 1:22-cv-01252, 1:22-cv-01258, 1:22-cv-
01263)
District Judge: Honorable Richard G. Andrews

Argued on November 6, 2024

Before: KRAUSE, SCIRICA, and RENDELL, *Circuit Judges*

JUDGMENT

This cause came to be considered on the record from the United States District Court for the District of Delaware and was submitted on November 6, 2024.

On consideration whereof, it is now hereby **ORDERED** and **ADJUDGED** by this Court that the order of the District Court entered on March 28, 2023, be and the same is hereby **AFFIRMED IN PART** and **REVERSED IN PART** and **REMANDED**. Costs shall be taxed against Appellants in Nos. 23-1664, 23-1665, 23-1666, 23-1667, 23-1668, 23-1669, 23-1670, 23-1671, 23-1672, 23-1674, 23-1675, 23-1676, 23-1677, 23-1678, and 23-1780, and against Appellees in No. 23-1673.

All of the above in accordance with the opinion of this Court.

ATTEST:

s/Patricia S. Dodszeit
Clerk

DATE: May 13, 2025

OFFICE OF THE CLERK

PATRICIA S. DODSZUWEIT

CLERK



UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS

FOR THE THIRD CIRCUIT
21400 UNITED STATES COURTHOUSE
601 MARKET STREET

PHILADELPHIA, PA 19106-1790

Website: www.ca3.uscourts.gov

TELEPHONE

215-597-2995

]May 13, 2025

Derek C. Abbott
Morris Nichols Arsht & Tunnell
1201 N Market Street
16th Floor
P.O. Box 1347
Wilmington, DE 19899

Philip D. Anker
Wilmer Cutler Pickering Hale & Dorr
7 World Trade Center
250 Greenwich Street
New York, NY 10007

Lorraine M. Armenti
Coughlin Midlige & Garland
350 Mount Kemble Avenue
P.O. Box 1917
Morristown, NJ 07962

John E.W. Baay II
Laborde Siegel
701 Poydras Street
Suite 4800
New Orleans, LA 70139

Joseph T. Baio
240 Centre Street
New York, NY 10013

Marla S. Benedek
Cozen O'Connor
1201 N Market Street
Suite 1001
Wilmington, DE 19801

Mary E. Borja

Wiley Rein
2050 M Street NW
Washington, DC 20036

Theodore J. Boutrous Jr.
Gibson Dunn & Crutcher
333 S Grand Avenue
Suite 4600
Los Angeles, CA 90071

Robert S. Brady
Young Conaway Stargatt & Taylor
1000 N King Street
Rodney Square
Wilmington, DE 19801

Daniel N. Brogan
Bayard
600 N King Street
Suite 400
Wilmington, DE 19801

Charles J. Brown III
Gellert Seitz Busenkell & Brown
1201 N Orange Street
Suite 300
Wilmington, DE 19801

John E. Bucheit
Parker Hudson Rainer & Dobbs
Two N Riverside Plaza
Suite 1850
Chicago, IL 60606

Daniel J. Bussel
Klee Tuchin Bogdanoff & Stern
1801 Century Park East
26th Floor
Los Angeles, CA 90067

George R. Calhoun V
Ifrah Law
1717 Pennsylvania Avenue NW
Suite 650
Washington, DC 20006

Robert D. Cecil Jr.
Tybout Redfearn & Pell
501 Carr Road
Suite 300
Wilmington, DE 19809

Bruce D. Celebrezze
Clyde & Co
150 California Street
15th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94111

David C. Christian II
David Christian Attorneys
105 W Madison Street
Suite 1400
Chicago, IL 60602

Ashley-Anne Criss
Wiley Rein
2050 M Street NW
Washington, DC 20036

Joseph G. Davis
Willkie Farr & Gallagher
1875 K Street NW
Washington, DC 20006

Richard J. Doren
Gibson Dunn & Crutcher
333 S Grand Avenue
Suite 4600
Los Angeles, CA 90071

Gilion C. Dumas
Dumas & Vaughn
1000 SW Broadway
Suite 2150
Portland, OR 97205

Mark W. Eckard
Raines Feldman Littrell
1200 N Broom Street
Wilmington, DE 19806

David Elbaum

Simpson Thacher & Bartlett
425 Lexington Avenue
New York, NY 10017

Kenneth J. Enos
Young Conaway Stargatt & Taylor
1000 N King Street
Rodney Square
Wilmington, DE 19801

Blaine H. Evanson
Gibson Dunn & Crutcher
3161 Michelson Drive
Suite 1200
Irvine, CA 92612

Gregory J. Flasser
Bayard
600 N King Street
Suite 400
Wilmington, DE 19801

David M. Fournier
Troutman Pepper Locke
1313 N Market Street
Suite 1000, Hercules Plaza
P.O. Box 1709
Wilmington, DE 19899

Gregory G. Garre
Latham & Watkins
555 11th Street NW
Suite 1000
Washington, DC 20004

Douglas R. Gooding
Choate Hall & Stewart
Two International Place
Boston, MA 02110

Eric R. Goodman
Brown Rudnick
7 Times Square
47th Floor
New York, NY 10036

Ronald K Gorsich
White & Case
555 S Flower Street
Suite 2700
Los Angeles, CA 90071

Debra I. Grassgreen
Pachulski Stang Ziehl & Jones
919 N Market Street
P.O. Box 8705, 17th Floor
Wilmington, DE 19801

Kelly A. Green
Smith Katzenstein & Jenkins
1000 N West Street
The Brandywine Building, Suite 1501
Wilmington, DE 19801

Emily Grim
Gilbert
700 Pennsylvania Avenue SE
Suite 400
Washington, DC 20003

Susan N. Gummow
Foran Glennon Palandech Ponzi & Rudloff
222 N LaSalle Street
Suite 1400
Chicago, IL 60601

Lloyd A. Gura
Mound Cotton Wollan & Greengrass
One New York Plaza
44th Floor
New York, NY 10004

Kurt F. Gwynne
Reed Smith
1201 N Market Street
Suite 1500
Wilmington, DE 19801

Jonathan D. Hacker
O'Melveny & Myers
1625 Eye Street NW
Washington, DC 20006

James L. Hallowell
Gibson Dunn & Crutcher
200 Park Avenue
47th Floor
New York, NY 10166

Matthew A. Hamermesh
Hangley Aronchick Segal Pudlin & Schiller
One Logan Square
18th & Cherry Streets, 27th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19103

Edwin J. Harron
Young Conaway Stargatt & Taylor
1000 N King Street
Rodney Square
Wilmington, DE 19801

Patricia O. Haynes
Willkie Farr & Gallagher
787 Seventh Avenue
New York, NY 10019

Robert K. Hill
Seitz Van Ogtrop & Green
222 Delaware Avenue
Suite 1500, P.O. Box 68
Wilmington, DE 19801

Michael Hrinewski
Coughlin Midlige & Garland
350 Mount Kemble Avenue
P.O. Box 1917
Morristown, NJ 07962

December L. Huddleston
Gilbert
700 Pennsylvania Avenue SE
Suite 400
Washington, DC 20003

Michael Huston
Perkins Coie
2525 E Camelback Road
Suite 500

Phoenix, AZ 85016

Todd C. Jacobs
Parker Hudson Rainer & Dobbs
Two N Riverside Plaza
Suite 1850
Chicago, IL 60606

Michael J. Joyce
1225 King Street
Suite 800
Wilmington, DE 19801

Mitchell A. Karlan
Gibson Dunn & Crutcher
200 Park Avenue
47th Floor
New York, NY 10166

Kathleen K. Kerns
Post & Schell
Three Logan Square
1717 Arch Street
24th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19103

David M. Klauder
Bielli & Klauder
1204 N King Street
Wilmington, DE 19801

Eric Konopka
Latham & Watkins
555 11th Street NW
Suite 1000
Washington, DC 20004

Alan J. Kornfeld
Pachulski Stang Ziehl & Jones
10100 Santa Monica Boulevard
Suite 1300
Los Angeles, CA 90067

Konrad R. Krebs
Clyde & Co
1515 Market Street

Suite 1200
Philadelphia, PA 19102

David R. Kuney
9200 Cambridge Manor Court
Potomac, MD 20854

Carl N. Kunz III
Morris James
500 Delaware Avenue
Suite 1500
Wilmington, DE 19801

Glenn M. Kurtz
White & Case
1221 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10020

Jessica C. Lauria
White & Case
1221 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10020

Matthew E. Linder
White & Case
111 S Wacker Drive
Suite 5100
Chicago, IL 33130

Paul A. Logan
Post & Schell
300 Delaware Avenue
Suite 1380
Wilmington, DE 19801

Christopher D. Loizides
Loizides
1225 King Street
Suite 800
Wilmington, DE 19801

John W. Lucas
Pachulski Stang Ziehl & Jones
919 N Market Street
P.O. Box 8705, 17th Floor
Wilmington, DE 19801

Delia S. Lujan Wolff
Lujan & Wolff
238 Archbishop
Suite 300, DNA Building
Hagatna, 96920
Guam

Kim V. Marrkand
Mintz Levin Cohn Ferris Glovsky & Popeo
One Financial Center
Boston, MA 02111

Jonathan D. Marshall
Choate Hall & Stewart
Two International Place
Boston, MA 02110

R. Craig Martin
DLA Piper
1201 N Market Street
Suite 2100
Wilmington, DE 19801

Keith Martorana
Gibson Dunn & Crutcher
200 Park Avenue
47th Floor
New York, NY 10166

Bruce W. McCullough
Bodell Bove
1225 N King Street
Suite 1000
Wilmington, DE 19801

Bryana McGillicuddy
Choate Hall & Stewart
Two International Place
Boston, MA 02110

William E. McGrath Jr.
Dilworth Paxson
2 Research Way
Princeton, NJ 08540

Rachel B. Mersky
Monzack Mersky McLaughlin & Browder
1201 N Orange Street
Suite 400
Wilmington, DE 19899

Kathleen M. Miller
Smith Katzenstein & Jenkins
1000 N West Street
The Brandywine Building, Suite 1501
Wilmington, DE 19801

Stephen M. Miller
Morris James
500 Delaware Avenue
Suite 1500
Wilmington, DE 19801

Pamela J. Milnetto
Mound Cotton Wollan & Greengrass
One New York Plaza
44th Floor
New York, NY 10004

Nicole Molner
O'Melveny & Myers
1301 Avenue of the Americas
Suite 1700
New York, NY 10019

David J. Molton
Brown Rudnick
7 Times Square
47th Floor
New York, NY 10036

Iain A.W. Nasatir
Pachulski Stang Ziehl & Jones
919 N Market Street
P.O. Box 8705, 17th Floor
Wilmington, DE 19801

James E. O'Neill
Pachulski Stang Ziehl & Jones
919 N Market Street
P.O. Box 8705, 17th Floor

Wilmington, DE 19801

James E. O'Neill III
Pachulski Stang Ziehl & Jones
919 N Market Street
P.O. Box 8705, 17th Floor
Wilmington, DE 19801

Isaac M. Pachulski
Pachulski Stang Ziehl & Jones
10100 Santa Monica Boulevard
Suite 1300
Los Angeles, CA 90067

Richard M. Pachulski
Pachulski Stang Ziehl & Jones
919 N Market Street
P.O. Box 8705, 17th Floor
Wilmington, DE 19801

Thomas E. Patterson
Klee Tuchin Bogdanoff & Stern
1801 Century Park East
26th Floor
Los Angeles, CA 90067

Alexander E. Potente
Clyde & Co
150 California Street
15th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94111

Kami E. Quinn
Gilbert
700 Pennsylvania Avenue SE
Suite 400
Washington, DC 20003

Andrew R. Remming
Morris Nichols Arsht & Tunnell
1201 N Market Street
16th Floor
P.O. Box 1347
Wilmington, DE 19899

Deirdre M. Richards

Elliott Greenleaf
1105 N Market Street
Suite 1700
Wilmington, DE 19801

Louis J. Rizzo Jr.
Reger Rizzo & Darnall
1521 Concord Pike
Brandywine Plaza West, Suite 305
Wilmington, DE 19803

Matthew Roberts
Parker Hudson Rainer & Dobbs
303 Peachtree Street NE
Suite 3600
Atlanta, GA 30308

Sophie Rogers Churchill
Morris Nichols Arsht & Tunnell
1201 N Market Street
16th Floor
P.O. Box 1347
Wilmington, DE 19899

Seth M. Rokosky
Gibson Dunn & Crutcher
200 Park Avenue
47th Floor
New York, NY 10166

Michael A. Rosenthal
Gibson Dunn & Crutcher
200 Park Avenue
47th Floor
New York, NY 10166

Maria A. Sawczuk
Goldstein & McClintock
501 Silverside Road
Suite 65
Wilmington, DE 19809

Tancred V. Schiavoni
O'Melveny & Myers
1301 Avenue of the Americas
Suite 1700

New York, NY 10019

Ronald P. Schiller
Hangley Aronchick Segal Pudlin & Schiller
One Logan Square
18th & Cherry Streets, 27th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19103

Gary P. Seligman
Wiley Rein
2050 M Street NW
Washington, DC 20036

Ryan Smethurst
McDermott Will & Emery
500 N Capitol Street NW
Washington, DC 20001

Evan Smola
Hurley McKenna & Mertz
20 S Clark Street
Suite 2250
Chicago, IL 60603

Alex M. Spisak
McDermott Will & Emery
500 N Capitol Street NW
Washington, DC 20001

Christopher J. St. Jeanos
Willkie Farr & Gallagher
787 Seventh Avenue
New York, NY 10019

Stamatios Stamoulis
Stamoulis & Weinblatt
800 N West Street
3rd Floor
Wilmington, DE 19801

Brian A. Sullivan
Werb & Sullivan
1225 N King Street
Suite 600
Wilmington, DE 19801

Matthew G. Summers
Ballard Spahr
919 N Market Street
11th Floor
Wilmington, DE 19801

Adam J. Tragone
University of Pittsburgh School of Law
3900 Forbes Avenue
Pittsburgh, PA 15260

Margaret H. Warner
McDermott Will & Emery
500 N Capitol Street NW
Washington, DC 20001

Stephen H. Warren
O'Melveny & Myers
400 S Hope Street
18th Floor
Los Angeles, CA 90071

Thaddeus J. Weaver
Dilworth Paxson
800 N King Street
Suite 202
Wilmington, DE 19801

William H. White Jr.
Kiernan Trebach
1233 20th Street NW
8th Floor
Washington, DC 20036

Harris B. Winsberg
Parker Hudson Rainer & Dobbs
303 Peachtree Street NE
Suite 3600
Atlanta, GA 30308

RE: In re: Boy Scouts of America and Delaware BSA LLC
Case Number: 23-1664
District Court Case Number: 1:22-cv-01237
District Court Case Number: 1:22-cv-01258

ENTRY OF JUDGMENT

Today, **May 13, 2025**, the Court entered its judgment in the above-captioned matter pursuant to Fed. R. App. P. 36.

If you wish to seek review of the Court's decision, you may file a petition for rehearing. The procedures for filing a petition for rehearing are set forth in Fed. R. App. P. 40, 3rd Cir. LAR 35 and 40, and summarized below.

Time for Filing:

14 days after entry of judgment.

45 days after entry of judgment in a civil case if the United States is a party.

Form Limits:

3900 words if produced by a computer, with a certificate of compliance pursuant to Fed. R. App. P. 32(g).

15 pages if hand or type written.

Attachments:

A copy of the panel's opinion and judgment only.

Certificate of service, unless the petition is filed and served through the Court's electronic-filing system.

Certificate of compliance if petition is produced by a computer.

No other attachments are permitted without first obtaining leave from the Court.

Unless the petition specifies that the petition seeks only panel rehearing, the petition will be construed as requesting both panel and en banc rehearing. A party seeking both forms of rehearing must file the petitions as a single document. Fed. R. App. P. 40(a).

A party who is entitled to costs pursuant to Fed.R.App.P. 39 must file an itemized and verified bill of costs within 14 days from the entry of judgment. The bill of costs must be submitted on the proper form which is available on the court's website.

A mandate will be issued at the appropriate time in accordance with the Fed. R. App. P. 41.

Please consult the Rules of the Supreme Court of the United States regarding the timing and requirements for filing a petition for writ of certiorari.

Very truly yours,

Patricia S. Dodszuweit, Clerk

By: Stephanie

Case Manager

Direct Dial 267-299-4926